

Conversation Contents

Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

"Flory, Jason" <jason_flory@fws.gov>

From: "Flory, Jason" <jason_flory@fws.gov>
Sent: Tue Mar 05 2019 11:00:42 GMT-0700 (MST)
To: "Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
CC: Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Um....I'm taking it over and completing it? Last I heard I was reviewing it and providing edits/comments.

I realize things are rather hectic at the moment, but we need to do a better job of clearly articulating assignments.

On Mon, Mar 4, 2019 at 4:29 PM Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov> wrote:

Hello Shelly. I wanted to give you an update. Marshall had a family emergency and has been out for the last week. Jason Flory is taking over the consultation to bring it to completion. It will be delayed about 2 weeks. Please feel free to contact Jason or I if you have any questions or concerns.

Katy

On Wed, Nov 28, 2018 at 12:18 PM Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil> wrote:

Hello Mr Williams – I just received your voicemail. Sorry for not responding sooner. BNSF and Jacobs are working on responses to your questions. We hope to have something back to you shortly. Thanks for following up.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Williams, Marshall <marshall_williams@fws.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, November 21, 2018 3:47 PM
To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Fischer, Steven M CIV <Steven.M.Fischer3@uscg.mil>; Moore, James M CIV <James.M.Moore2@uscg.mil>
Cc: Katy Fitzgerald <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>; PaDelford, Sue S. <Sue.PaDelford@jacobs.com>; Broadhead, Craig <Craig.Broadhead@jacobs.com>
Subject: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Ms. Surgarman, and others;

I'm currently reviewing the Biological Assessment (BA) on the Sandpoint Connector Project and need some additional information for this consultation. The BA states that bull trout rearing and reproduction does not occur in the Project area (p. 44). While this is true, the BA also states the following:

"Adverse effects on survival and fitness can occur even in the absence of overt injury. Exposure to elevated noise levels can cause a temporary shift in hearing sensitivity (referred to as a temporary threshold shift), decreasing sensory capability for periods lasting from hours to days (Turnpenny et al. 1994; Hastings et al. 1996). Popper et al. (2005) found temporary threshold shifts in hearing sensitivity after exposure to cumulative SELs as low as 184 dB. Temporary threshold shifts reduce the survival, growth, and reproduction of the affected fish by increasing the risk of predation and reducing foraging or spawning success." p. 46.

If there is an indirect effect to "reproduction" or "spawning success" as a result of the proposed action that occurs later in time, and is reasonably certain to occur, it should be analyzed in the BA. Initial questions, and observations that come to mind:

- In addition to temporary threshold shifts, Popper (2005) speaks to permanent threshold shifts. Are there long-term physiological effects from pile driving that will affect reproduction in bull trout? or are the physiological effects from the action of short enough duration they will not affect bull trout reproduction that occurs outside of the action area?
- How big an impact on reproduction can be expected? For how long?
- An electronic search for "reproduction" and "spawning" of Popper (2005), cited directly before the statement on reproduction and spawning success, was unsuccessful; Turnpenny, et al, 1994, focused on marine fish where spawning may occur in the area of hydroacoustic activity, rather than migratory freshwater fish, and a search for reproduction within the document was unsuccessful, and spawning returned only one reference that wasn't applicable; I was not able to obtain a copy of Hasting, et al, 1996 to review - please provide an electronic copy for this consultation.

Bull trout use tributaries on Lake Pend Oreille for spawning reproduction. Since the BA states that hydroacoustic impacts can have an effects to reproduction or spawning success, please provide the analysis on those impacts.

Thank you, Marshall Williams

--

Marshall L. Williams

Fish and Wildlife Biologist

U.S Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr

Spokane, WA 99206

eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald
US Fish and Wildlife Service
IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead
11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2
Spokane Valley, WA 99206

Main Office: [REDACTED]

Direct Office: [REDACTED]

--

Jason Flory
Fish and Wildlife Biologist
U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service
11103 E. Montgomery Dr. Spokane, WA 99206

[REDACTED]

"Flory, Jason" <jason_flory@fws.gov>

From: "Flory, Jason" <jason_flory@fws.gov>
Sent: Tue Mar 05 2019 18:09:56 GMT-0700 (MST)
To: "Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
CC: Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

I'm going through the draft and FYI.....there's no sections about conservation needs of bull trout specific to the recovery unit, nor is there a section on critical habitat in the action area. Marshall had flagged those as lacking back on Jan. 30.

So the point is, this BO is going to need quite a bit of work.

On Tue, Mar 5, 2019 at 10:00 AM Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov> wrote:

Um....I'm taking it over and completing it? Last I heard I was reviewing it and providing edits/comments.

I realize things are rather hectic at the moment, but we need to do a better job of clearly articulating assignments.

On Mon, Mar 4, 2019 at 4:29 PM Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov> wrote:

Hello Shelly. I wanted to give you an update. Marshall had a family emergency and has been out for the last week. Jason Flory is taking over the consultation to bring it to completion. It will be delayed about 2 weeks. Please feel free to contact Jason or I if you have any questions or concerns.

Katy

On Wed, Nov 28, 2018 at 12:18 PM Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil> wrote:

Hello Mr Williams – I just received your voicemail. Sorry for not responding sooner. BNSF and Jacobs are working on responses to your questions. We hope to have something back to you shortly. Thanks for following up.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Williams, Marshall <marshall_williams@fws.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, November 21, 2018 3:47 PM

To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Fischer, Steven M CIV <Steven.M.Fischer3@uscg.mil>; Moore, James M CIV <James.M.Moore2@uscg.mil>

Cc: Katy Fitzgerald <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>; PaDelford, Sue S.

<Sue.PaDelford@jacobs.com>; Broadhead, Craig <Craig.Broadhead@jacobs.com>

Subject: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Ms. Surgarman, and others;

I'm currently reviewing the Biological Assessment (BA) on the Sandpoint Connector Project and need some additional information for this consultation. The BA states that bull trout rearing and reproduction does not occur in the Project area (p. 44). While this is true, the BA also states the following:

"Adverse effects on survival and fitness can occur even in the absence of overt injury. Exposure to elevated noise levels can cause a temporary shift in hearing sensitivity (referred to as a temporary threshold shift), decreasing sensory capability for periods lasting from hours to days (Turnpenny et al. 1994; Hastings et al. 1996). Popper et al. (2005) found temporary threshold shifts in hearing sensitivity after exposure to cumulative SELs as low as 184 dB. Temporary threshold shifts reduce the survival, growth, and reproduction of the affected fish by increasing the risk of predation and reducing foraging or spawning success." p. 46.

If there is an indirect effect to "reproduction" or "spawning success" as a result of the proposed action that occurs later in time, and is reasonably certain to occur, it should be analyzed in the BA. Initial questions, and observations that come to mind:

- In addition to temporary threshold shifts, Popper (2005) speaks to permanent threshold shifts. Are there long-term physiological effects from pile driving that will

affect reproduction in bull trout? or are the physiological effects from the action of short enough duration they will not affect bull trout reproduction that occurs outside of the action area?

- How big an impact on reproduction can be expected? For how long?
- An electronic search for "reproduction" and "spawning" of Popper (2005), cited directly before the statement on reproduction and spawning success, was unsuccessful; Turnpenny, et al, 1994, focused on marine fish where spawning may occur in the area of hydroacoustic activity, rather than migratory freshwater fish, and a search for reproduction within the document was unsuccessful, and spawning returned only one reference that wasn't applicable; I was not able to obtain a copy of Hasting, et al, 1996 to review - please provide an electronic copy for this consultation.

Bull trout use tributaries on Lake Pend Oreille for spawning reproduction. Since the BA states that hydroacoustic impacts can have an effects to reproduction or spawning success, please provide the analysis on those impacts.

Thank you, Marshall Williams

--

Marshall L. Williams

Fish and Wildlife Biologist

U.S Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr

Spokane, WA 99206

eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald
US Fish and Wildlife Service
IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead
11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2
Spokane Valley, WA 99206

Main Office: [REDACTED]

Direct Office: [REDACTED]

--

Jason Flory
Fish and Wildlife Biologist
U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service
11103 E. Montgomery Dr. Spokane, WA 99206



--

Jason Flory
Fish and Wildlife Biologist
U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service
11103 E. Montgomery Dr. Spokane, WA 99206



"Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>

From: "Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
Sent: Tue Mar 05 2019 19:33:54 GMT-0700 (MST)
To: Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>, cjohnson_hughes1@verizon.net
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

I know I asked Jason if he could take this on. Apparently what I said and he heard were 2 different things. Marshall can probably pick this back up when he gets back but I didnt want the progress to stop. K

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov>
Date: Tue, Mar 5, 2019 at 10:00 AM
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information
To: Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
Cc: Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>

Um....I'm taking it over and completing it? Last I heard I was reviewing it and providing edits/comments.

I realize things are rather hectic at the moment, but we need to do a better job of clearly articulating assignments.

On Mon, Mar 4, 2019 at 4:29 PM Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov> wrote:

Hello Shelly. I wanted to give you an update. Marshall had a family emergency and has been out for the last week. Jason Flory is taking over the consultation to bring it to completion. It will be delayed about 2 weeks. Please feel free to contact Jason or I if you have any questions or concerns.

Katy

On Wed, Nov 28, 2018 at 12:18 PM Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>

wrote:

Hello Mr Williams – I just received your voicemail. Sorry for not responding sooner. BNSF and Jacobs are working on responses to your questions. We hope to have something back to you shortly. Thanks for following up.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Williams, Marshall <marshall_williams@fws.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, November 21, 2018 3:47 PM
To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Fischer, Steven M CIV <Steven.M.Fischer3@uscg.mil>; Moore, James M CIV <James.M.Moore2@uscg.mil>
Cc: Katy Fitzgerald <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>; PaDelford, Sue S. <Sue.PaDelford@jacobs.com>; Broadhead, Craig <Craig.Broadhead@jacobs.com>
Subject: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Ms. Surgarman, and others;

I'm currently reviewing the Biological Assessment (BA) on the Sandpoint Connector Project and need some additional information for this consultation. The BA states that bull trout rearing and reproduction does not occur in the Project area (p. 44). While this is true, the BA also states the following:

"Adverse effects on survival and fitness can occur even in the absence of overt injury. Exposure to elevated noise levels can cause a temporary shift in hearing sensitivity (referred to as a temporary threshold shift), decreasing sensory capability for periods lasting from hours to days (Turnpenny et al. 1994; Hastings et al. 1996). Popper et al. (2005) found temporary threshold shifts in hearing sensitivity after exposure to cumulative SELs as low as 184 dB. Temporary threshold shifts reduce the survival, growth, and reproduction of the affected fish by increasing the risk of predation and reducing foraging or spawning success." p. 46.

If there is an indirect effect to "reproduction" or "spawning success" as a result of the proposed action that occurs later in time, and is reasonably certain to occur, it should be analyzed in the BA. Initial questions, and observations that come to mind:

- In addition to temporary threshold shifts, Popper (2005) speaks to permanent threshold shifts. Are there long-term physiological effects from pile driving that will affect reproduction in bull trout? or are the physiological effects from the action of short enough duration they will not affect bull trout reproduction that occurs outside of the action area?
- How big an impact on reproduction can be expected? For how long?
- An electronic search for "reproduction" and "spawning" of Popper (2005), cited directly before the statement on reproduction and spawning success, was

unsuccessful; Turnpenny, et al, 1994, focused on marine fish where spawning may occur in the area of hydroacoustic activity, rather than migratory freshwater fish, and a search for reproduction within the document was unsuccessful, and spawning returned only one reference that wasn't applicable; I was not able to obtain a copy of Hasting, et al, 1996 to review - please provide an electronic copy for this consultation.

Bull trout use tributaries on Lake Pend Oreille for spawning reproduction. Since the BA states that hydroacoustic impacts can have an effects to reproduction or spawning success, please provide the analysis on those impacts.

Thank you, Marshall Williams

--

Marshall L. Williams

Fish and Wildlife Biologist

U.S Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr

Spokane, WA 99206

eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald
US Fish and Wildlife Service
IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead
11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2
Spokane Valley, WA 99206

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Jason Flory
Fish and Wildlife Biologist
U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr. Spokane, WA 99206

--

Katy Fitzgerald
US Fish and Wildlife Service
IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead
11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2
Spokane Valley, WA 99206

"Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>

From: "Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
Sent: Mon Mar 25 2019 15:03:30 GMT-0600 (MDT)
To: Marshall Williams <marshall_williams@fws.gov>, Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

I just asked for 2 weeks. Didnt assign a date. We received formal request for consultation October 4th, You received final responses to your information request Nov 30. I was working off the October 4th and adding 35 days for furlough when I requested it. This would have put us on March 9th.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Sugarman, Shelly CIV** <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>
Date: Tue, Mar 5, 2019 at 7:18 AM
Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information
To: Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>, Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov>

Katy – thank you for the update. I'll let the project team know.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
Sent: Monday, March 4, 2019 7:29 PM
To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for

information

Hello Shelly. I wanted to give you an update. Marshall had a family emergency and has been out for the last week. Jason Flory is taking over the consultation to bring it to completion. It will be delayed about 2 weeks. Please feel free to contact Jason or I if you have any questions or concerns.

Katy

On Wed, Nov 28, 2018 at 12:18 PM Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil> wrote:

Hello Mr Williams – I just received your voicemail. Sorry for not responding sooner. BNSF and Jacobs are working on responses to your questions. We hope to have something back to you shortly. Thanks for following up.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Williams, Marshall <marshall_williams@fws.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, November 21, 2018 3:47 PM
To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Fischer, Steven M CIV <Steven.M.Fischer3@uscg.mil>; Moore, James M CIV <James.M.Moore2@uscg.mil>
Cc: Katy Fitzgerald <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>; PaDelford, Sue S. <Sue.PaDelford@jacobs.com>; Broadhead, Craig <Craig.Broadhead@jacobs.com>
Subject: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Ms. Surgarman, and others;

I'm currently reviewing the Biological Assessment (BA) on the Sandpoint Connector Project and need some additional information for this consultation. The BA states that bull trout rearing and reproduction does not occur in the Project area (p. 44). While this is true, the BA also states the following:

"Adverse effects on survival and fitness can occur even in the absence of overt injury. Exposure to elevated noise levels can cause a temporary shift in hearing sensitivity (referred to as a temporary threshold shift), decreasing sensory capability for periods lasting from hours to days (Turnpenny et al. 1994; Hastings et al. 1996). Popper et al. (2005) found temporary threshold shifts in hearing sensitivity after exposure to cumulative SELs as low as 184 dB. Temporary threshold shifts reduce the survival, growth, and reproduction of the affected fish by increasing the risk of predation and reducing foraging or spawning success." p. 46.

If there is an indirect effect to "reproduction" or "spawning success" as a result of the proposed action that occurs later in time, and is reasonably certain to occur, it should be analyzed in the BA. Initial questions, and observations that come to mind:

- In addition to temporary threshold shifts, Popper (2005) speaks to permanent threshold shifts. Are there long-term physiological effects from pile driving that will affect reproduction in bull trout? or are the physiological effects from the action of short enough duration they will not affect bull trout reproduction that occurs outside of the action area?
- How big an impact on reproduction can be expected? For how long?
- An electronic search for "reproduction" and "spawning" of Popper (2005), cited directly before the statement on reproduction and spawning success, was unsuccessful; Turnpenny, et al, 1994, focused on marine fish where spawning may occur in the area of hydroacoustic activity, rather than migratory freshwater fish, and a search for reproduction within the document was unsuccessful, and spawning returned only one reference that wasn't applicable; I was not able to obtain a copy of Hasting, et al, 1996 to review - please provide an electronic copy for this consultation.

Bull trout use tributaries on Lake Pend Oreille for spawning reproduction. Since the BA states that hydroacoustic impacts can have an effects to reproduction or spawning success, please provide the analysis on those impacts.

Thank you, Marshall Williams

--

Marshall L. Williams

Fish and Wildlife Biologist

U.S Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr

Spokane, WA 99206

eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald

US Fish and Wildlife Service

IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead

11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2

Spokane Valley, WA 99206

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

*Katy Fitzgerald
US Fish and Wildlife Service
IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead
11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2
Spokane Valley, WA 99206*

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Williams, Marshall" <marshall_williams@fws.gov>

From: "Williams, Marshall" <marshall_williams@fws.gov>
Sent: Mon Mar 25 2019 15:55:25 GMT-0600 (MDT)
To: "Fitzgerald, Katy" <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>
CC: Christy JohnsonHughes <christy_johnsonhughes@fws.gov>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

I've left a voicemail for Shelly Sugarman to talk with her about an extension to April 5th to give us time for any editorial revision, or additional time for internal coordination.

v/r mw

On Mon, Mar 25, 2019 at 2:03 PM Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov> wrote:

I just asked for 2 weeks. Didnt assign a date. We received formal request for consultation October 4th, You received final responses to your information request Nov 30. I was working off the October 4th and adding 35 days

for furlough when I requested it. This would have put us on March 9th.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>

Date: Tue, Mar 5, 2019 at 7:18 AM

Subject: RE: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

To: Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>, Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov>

Katy – thank you for the update. I'll let the project team know.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Fitzgerald, Katy <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>

Sent: Monday, March 4, 2019 7:29 PM

To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Flory, Jason <jason_flory@fws.gov>

Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] RE: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Hello Shelly. I wanted to give you an update. Marshall had a family emergency and has been out for the last week. Jason Flory is taking over the consultation to bring it to completion. It will be delayed about 2 weeks. Please feel free to contact Jason or I if you have any questions or concerns.

Katy

On Wed, Nov 28, 2018 at 12:18 PM Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil> wrote:

Hello Mr Williams – I just received your voicemail. Sorry for not responding sooner. BNSF and Jacobs are working on responses to your questions. We hope to have something back to you shortly. Thanks for following up.

Shelly Sugarman

From: Williams, Marshall <marshall_williams@fws.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, November 21, 2018 3:47 PM

To: Sugarman, Shelly CIV <Shelly.H.Sugarman@uscg.mil>; Fischer, Steven M CIV <Steven.M.Fischer3@uscg.mil>; Moore, James M CIV <James.M.Moore2@uscg.mil>

Cc: Katy Fitzgerald <katy_fitzgerald@fws.gov>; PaDelford, Sue S. <Sue.PaDelford@jacobs.com>; Broadhead, Craig <Craig.Broadhead@jacobs.com>

Subject: [Non-DoD Source] BNSF Sandpoint Connector Project BA - Request for information

Ms. Surgarman, and others;

I'm currently reviewing the Biological Assessment (BA) on the Sandpoint Connector Project and need some additional information for this consultation. The BA states that bull trout rearing and reproduction does not occur in the Project area (p. 44). While this is true, the BA also states the following:

"Adverse effects on survival and fitness can occur even in the absence of overt injury. Exposure to elevated noise levels can cause a temporary shift in hearing sensitivity (referred to as a temporary threshold shift), decreasing sensory capability for periods lasting from hours to days (Turnpenny et al. 1994; Hastings et al. 1996). Popper et al. (2005) found temporary threshold shifts in hearing sensitivity after exposure to cumulative SELs as low as 184 dB. Temporary threshold shifts reduce the survival, growth, and reproduction of the affected fish by increasing the risk of predation and reducing foraging or spawning success." p. 46.

If there is an indirect effect to "reproduction" or "spawning success" as a result of the proposed action that occurs later in time, and is reasonably certain to occur, it should be analyzed in the BA. Initial questions, and observations that come to mind:

- In addition to temporary threshold shifts, Popper (2005) speaks to permanent threshold shifts. Are there long-term physiological effects from pile driving that will affect reproduction in bull trout? or are the physiological effects from the action of short enough duration they will not affect bull trout reproduction that occurs outside of the action area?
- How big an impact on reproduction can be expected? For how long?
- An electronic search for "reproduction" and "spawning" of Popper (2005), cited directly before the statement on reproduction and spawning success, was unsuccessful; Turnpenny, et al, 1994, focused on marine fish where spawning may occur in the area of hydroacoustic activity, rather than migratory freshwater fish, and a search for reproduction within the document was unsuccessful, and spawning returned only one reference that wasn't applicable; I was not able to obtain a copy of Hasting, et al, 1996 to review - please provide an electronic copy for this consultation.

Bull trout use tributaries on Lake Pend Oreille for spawning reproduction. Since the BA states that hydroacoustic impacts can have an effects to reproduction or spawning success, please provide the analysis on those impacts.

Thank you, Marshall Williams

--

Marshall L. Williams

Fish and Wildlife Biologist

U.S Fish & Wildlife Service

11103 E. Montgomery Dr

Spokane, WA 99206

eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald

US Fish and Wildlife Service

IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead

11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2

Spokane Valley, WA 99206

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--

Katy Fitzgerald

US Fish and Wildlife Service

IFWO-Spokane, Section 7 lead

11103 E. Montgomery Dr, Ste 2

Spokane Valley, WA 99206

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

--
Marshall L. Williams
Fish and Wildlife Biologist
U.S Fish & Wildlife Service
11103 E. Montgomery Dr
Spokane, WA 99206
eMail: marshall_williams@fws.gov

