REPORT OF INVESTIGATION INTO THE CIRCUMSTANCES SURROUNDING THE INCIDENT INVOLVING VILLE D’ ORION / TOP GLORY / COLLISION

On 01/23/2003

MISLE Activity Number: 1740464
Originating Unit: MSO HONOLULU
MISLE Activity Owner: COMMANDANT (G-MRI)
MISLE Activity Controller: COMMANDANT (G-MRI)
MISLE Case Number: 0
I. INCIDENT BRIEF

FINDING OF FACT: COLLISION AT SEA BETWEEN GERMAN-FLAGGED M/V VILLE D'ORION & LIBERIAN-FLAGGED M/V TOP GLORY

The following was prepared by U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Office Honolulu at the request of Coast Guard Headquarters (G-MOA), on behalf of the German government.

SUMMARY:

Early on the morning of January 23, 2003, the German flagged container ship VILLE D' ORION (O.N. 9125619) and the Liberian flagged bulk freighter TOP GLORY (O.N. 8307820) collided at sea, roughly 265 nautical miles NNW of the Island of Kauai, Hawaii in approximate position N 26-52-1, W160-46-4. No injuries or pollution were reported. Damage to the VILLE D' ORION was sustained to the portside amidships side shell; final repairs have been estimated at $1.5 million by the vessel surveyor. Damage to the TOP GLORY was sustained at the bow; no repair estimates available.

For the purposes of reporting, using the International Maritime Organization (IMO) Reports on Marine Casualties and Incidents, the collision is a “serious casualty.”

Following the collision, the VILLE D' ORION made an unscheduled port call to Honolulu where temporary repairs were made. The TOP GLORY reportedly continued on its voyage to Japan. On January 25, U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Office (MSO) Honolulu personnel boarded the VILLE D' ORION to conduct a damage assessment, as well as a fact-finding investigation regarding the circumstances of the collision.

In accordance with U.S. Coast Guard Office of Compliance (G-MOA) Policy letter 1-98, the IMO standardized report on marine casualties and incidents was completed (See Exhibit 1). A narrative report was also entered in U.S. Coast Guard Marine Information Safety and Law Enforcement (MISLE) computerized Investigation Activity #1740464.

VESSEL DATA (See Exhibits 13 & 14):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>VILLE D' ORION</th>
<th>TOP GLORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O.N.</td>
<td>9125619</td>
<td>8307820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flag</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Container</td>
<td>Dry Bulk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross Tonnage</td>
<td>40465</td>
<td>23186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length</td>
<td>850.9 feet</td>
<td>572.5 feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class</td>
<td>Germanischer Lloyd</td>
<td>American Bureau of Shipping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Conti Cartegena Schifffahrts. GMBH</td>
<td>Top Glory Shipping Co. Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operator</td>
<td>N.S.B.</td>
<td>Manhattan Shipping Canada Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crew</td>
<td>German, Filipino, Spanish</td>
<td>Unk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hull</td>
<td>Steel</td>
<td>Steel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keel Laid</td>
<td>02-06-1996</td>
<td>06-22-1984</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VESSEL ROUTES:

The VILLE D' ORION was on a voyage from Pusan, Korea to Los Angeles, California (USA). According to log entries, crew statements, and plotted positions on the chart, the vessel was on a heading of 090 degrees true, proceeding at a speed of 20 knots.

The TOP GLORY was on a voyage from San Marcos, Chile to Japan. No data regarding the course and speed of the TOP GLORY could be obtained from either vessel.

WEATHER DATA:

As gathered from log entries and interviews of the watch from the VILLE D' ORION:

- Visibility – 0-5 miles, according to the lookout [redacted] and the chief mate [redacted], at times the bow mast was not visible from the bridge during the periods of heavy rain showers (See Exhibits 3 & 4).
- Seas – 7 meters (See Exhibit 9)
- Skies – passing heavy rain showers (See Exhibit 8)
- Temp – 20 degrees Celsius (See Exhibit 9)

CREW FATIGUE:

VILLE D' ORION - Lookout able-bodied seaman (A/B) [redacted] stated that he stood the 0000-0400 and the 1200-1600 watches on a daily basis while underway (See Exhibits 3 & 6). He stated that he had stood 8 hours of watch per day for the previous 96 hours leading up to the collision, and had no other assigned duties. According to Mr. [redacted], he had been ordered to extend his watch for one hour until 0500 on January 23, due to the reduced visibility (See Exhibit 3). Deck Officer, Chief Mate [redacted] stated that he stands the 0400-0800, and the 1600-2000 watches on a daily basis while underway. He stated that he had stood 8 hours of watch per day for the previous 96 hours leading up to the collision. He also stated that he usually makes an hour long round after each watch, and passes necessary duties to the boatswain for execution (See Exhibit 4).

TOP GLORY – no data available.

NAVIGATION:

1. Lights and Sound Signals

- VILLE D' ORION – The vessel had the following lights energized: sidelights, masthead and range lights, and stern light. Coast Guard officers confirmed all lights to be operational on January 25, 2003. According to the VILLE D' ORION watch standers, the vessel did not make
any sound signals during their period preceding the collision. They also stated that they did not hear any sound signals during the period before the collision.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

2. Training and Experience

· VILLE D’ORION – The Chief Mate holds a master unlimited license. He has been a mariner since 1987, and been aboard the vessel since November 24, 2002. The lookout holds an able-bodied seaman document. He has been a mariner since 1992, and been aboard the vessel since January 15, 2003.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

3. Electronic Aids and Charts

· VILLE D’ORION – The chart in use during the collision was BA (British Admiralty) 4809. Hourly plots were observed on the chart as well as a 090 degrees track line. Position plots were made using a GPS model NT200GPS, STN Atlas BSH/029/08266/2/96. The Chief Mate maintained his watch from a chair, looking forward and into the vessels ARPA radar (See Exhibit 5). The secondary radar system was located just left of the ARPA radar and was of the same make and model as the master. The ARPA radar was model Bediengeraet BD 3006, WNr. 00289 G005. The Chief Mate stated that he had set the alarm ranges of TCPA at 15 minutes, and the CPA at 1 mile. However, during periods of heavy weather he had secured the alarm due to the amount of sea and weather clutter appearing on the radar (See Exhibit 4). The lookout was physically located on the bridge looking forward (See Exhibit 5).

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

4. Publications


· TOP GLORY – no data available.

5. Standing Orders

· VILLE D’ORION – The most recent entry into the captain's standing order book was dated January 16, 2003 which stated “observe instruction of former master closely”.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

CHRONOLOGY / TIMELINE:

1. On January 23, 2003, at 0400 the M/V VILLE D’ORION was on a course of 090 degrees true with a speed of 20 knots (See Exhibit 9). M/V TOP GLORY was underway on an unknown course and speed.
2. 0400: The VILLE D' ORION had the following on watch and on the bridge; Deck Officer–Chief Mate [REDACTED], Lookout–A/B [REDACTED] (See Exhibits 4 & 8).

3. 0445: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate had “felt a pitch on the portside.” The Chief Mate stated that he immediately went out on the port side bridge wing, but did not observe another vessel (See Exhibit 4).

4. 0445-0452: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate stated that he had made 3-4 attempts on VHF radio channel 16, indicated his vessel's name location and asking “Is there anyone that hit me or collided?” No answer was received (See Exhibit 4).

5. 0452: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate called and notified the Captain that the vessel may have hit something (See Exhibits 4 & 8). He remarked the radar was full of clutter.

6. 0454 The VILLE D'ORION Captain [REDACTED] arrived on the bridge (See Exhibit 2).

7. 0504: The VILLE D'ORION Captain acquired the M/V TOP GLORY on the radar and stated that the vessel was 4.5 nautical miles off the starboard aft quarter on a course of 140 degrees and a speed of 9 to 9.4 knots (See Exhibit 2). The Captain also stated that he made radio call attempts over VHF radio to establish communications, but he did not receive a reply. The M/V VILLE D' ORION did not alter or change its course or speed at any time before, during or after the collision (See Exhibit 9).

8. 0530: The VILLE D' ORION Chief Mate conducted a deck inspection of the ship and did not observe any damage (See Exhibit 8).

9. 0700: The M/V VILLE D' ORION ship mechanic [REDACTED] discovered the damage to the vessel's port side (See Exhibits 5 & 8).

10. 1045: The M/V VILLE D' ORION made notification of the collision through DSC distress system (See Exhibit 2).

11. 1233: U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) conducted aircraft overflight and contacted the VILLE D' ORION by way of VHF radio, master confirmed no assistance required and that the vessel was heading to Honolulu (See Exhibits 12 & 15).

12. 1304: USCG conducted aircraft overflight and contacted the TOP GLORY by way of VHF radio; vessel master confirms that his vessel was involved in a collision, but was unable to determine the vessel's name. The master declined any assistance and relayed that he was continuing to his next port of call in Japan (See Exhibits 12 & 15).

13. January 24, 2003, at 0724, the VILLE D' ORION was boarded by a USCG security boarding team (See Exhibit 12).

14. 0740: The VILLE D' ORION was directed to remain at least three nautical miles off shore due to the closure of the anchorages as a result of high winds (See Exhibit 12).

16. 0900: MSO Honolulu Inspection and Investigation personnel boarded the vessel along with the VILLE D'ORION vessel class surveyor (John Mihlbauer, 808-220-7736), owner's representatives (Jonas Lyborg, 251-621-9777 & Dean Robb, 808-523-2703), and vessel agent (Russell Moore, 808-544-0453). The TOP GLORY surveyor (John Riley, 310-394-3190) also accompanied (See Exhibit 16).

17. 1600: MSO Honolulu personnel departed the vessel.

18. January 26, 2003, at 0800 VILLE D' ORION entered Honolulu Harbor and moored alongside Pier 1 to make temporary repairs to the fractures in the port side shell.


CONCLUSIONS:

Since little information or corroborating evidence could be obtained from the M/V TOP GLORY (aside from initial USCG aerial damage estimates), a complete analysis of the incident could not be performed to determine the manner of situation between the involved vessels (i.e., overtaking, crossing, or meeting) as well as operations aboard the TOP GLORY.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:
Exhibit 1  IMO Marine Casualty and Incident Report
Exhibit 2  Written statement from the master of the M/V VILLE D' ORION
Exhibit 3  Conversation record between USCG and lookout
Exhibit 4  Conversation record between USCG and chief mate
Exhibit 5  Digital Pictures (taken by USCG MSO Honolulu)
Exhibit 6  M/V VILLE D' ORION watch keeping schedule
Exhibit 7  M/V VILLE D' ORION particulars
Exhibit 8  M/V VILLE D' ORION copy of logbook entries for January 23, 2003
Exhibit 9  M/V VILLE D' ORION copy of deck log entries for January 23, 2003
Exhibit 10  M/V VILLE D' ORION crew list
Exhibit 11  E-mail message from M/V TOP GLORY to vessel agent
Exhibit 12  USCG Situation Report (SITREP)
Exhibit 13  M/V TOP GLORY vessel profile
Exhibit 14  M/V VILLE D' ORION vessel profile
Exhibit 15  VHS videotape of USCG overflight and damage survey
Exhibit 16  List of other involved parties
II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Incident Summary

FINDING OF FACT: COLLISION AT SEA BETWEEN GERMAN-FLAGGED M/V VILLE D'ORION & LIBERIAN-FLAGGED M/V TOP GLORY

The following was prepared by U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Office Honolulu at the request of Coast Guard Headquarters (G-MOA), on behalf of the German government.

SUMMARY:

Early on the morning of January 23, 2003, the German flagged container ship VILLE D' ORION (O.N. 9125619) and the Liberian flagged bulk freighter TOP GLORY (O.N. 8307820) collided at sea, roughly 265 nautical miles NNW of the Island of Kauai, Hawaii in approximate position N 26-52-1, W160-46-4. No injuries or pollution were reported. Damage to the VILLE D' ORION was sustained to the portside amidships side shell; final repairs have been estimated at $1.5 million by the vessel surveyor. Damage to the TOP GLORY was sustained at the bow; no repair estimates available.

For the purposes of reporting, using the International Maritime Organization (IMO) Reports on Marine Casualties and Incidents, the collision is a “serious casualty.”

Following the collision, the VILLE D' ORION made an unscheduled port call to Honolulu where temporary repairs were made. The TOP GLORY reportedly continued on its voyage to Japan. On January 25, U.S. Coast Guard Marine Safety Office (MSO) Honolulu personnel boarded the VILLE D' ORION to conduct a damage assessment, as well as a fact-finding investigation regarding the circumstances of the collision.

In accordance with U.S. Coast Guard Office of Compliance (G-MOA) Policy letter 1-98, the IMO standardized report on marine casualties and incidents was completed (See Exhibit 1). A narrative report was also entered in U.S. Coast Guard Marine Information Safety and Law Enforcement (MISLE) computerized Investigation Activity #1740464.

VESSEL DATA (See Exhibits 13 & 14):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>VILLE D' ORION</th>
<th>TOP GLORY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O.N.</td>
<td>9125619</td>
<td>8307820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flag</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>Liberia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Container</td>
<td>Dry Bulk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gross Tonnage</td>
<td>40465</td>
<td>23186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Length</td>
<td>850.9 feet</td>
<td>572.5 feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class</td>
<td>Germanischer Lloyd</td>
<td>American Bureau of Shipping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner</td>
<td>Conti Cartegena Schiffahrts. GMBH</td>
<td>Top Glory Shipping Co. Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operator</td>
<td>N.S.B.</td>
<td>Manhattan Shipping Canada Ltd.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crew</td>
<td>German, Filipino, Spanish</td>
<td>Unk.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VESSEL ROUTES:

The VILLE D’ ORION was on a voyage from Pusan, Korea to Los Angeles, California (USA). According to log entries, crew statements, and plotted positions on the chart, the vessel was on a heading of 090 degrees true, proceeding at a speed of 20 knots.

The TOP GLORY was on a voyage from San Marcos, Chile to Japan. No data regarding the course and speed of the TOP GLORY could be obtained from either vessel.

WEATHER DATA:

As gathered from log entries and interviews of the watch from the VILLE D’ ORION:

- Visibility – 0-5 miles, according to the lookout and the chief mate, at times the bow mast was not visible from the bridge during the periods of heavy rain showers (See Exhibits 3 & 4).
- Seas – 7 meters (See Exhibit 9)
- Wind – direction southwest, Beaufort force 7-8 (28 – 40 knots) (See Exhibit 9)
- Skies – passing heavy rain showers (See Exhibit 8)
- Temp – 20 degrees Celsius (See Exhibit 9)

CREW FATIGUE:

VILLE D’ ORION - Lookout able-bodied seaman (A/B) stated that he stood the 0000-0400 and the 1200-1600 watches on a daily basis while underway (See Exhibits 3 & 6). He stated that he had stood 8 hours of watch per day for the previous 96 hours leading up to the collision, and had no other assigned duties. According to , he had been ordered to extend his watch for one hour until 0500 on January 23, due to the reduced visibility (See Exhibit 3). Deck Officer, Chief Mate , stated that he stands the 0400-0800, and the 1600-2000 watches on a daily basis while underway. He stated that he had stood 8 hours of watch per day for the previous 96 hours leading up to the collision. He also stated that he usually makes an hour long round after each watch, and passes necessary duties to the boatswain for execution (See Exhibit 4).

TOP GLORY – no data available.

NAVIGATION:

1. Lights and Sound Signals

- VILLE D’ ORION – The vessel had the following lights energized: sidelights, masthead and range lights, and stern light. Coast Guard officers confirmed all lights to be operational on
January 25, 2003. According to the VILLE D' ORION watch standers, the vessel did not make any sound signals during their period preceding the collision. They also stated that they did not hear any sound signals during the period before the collision.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

2. Training and Experience

· VILLE D' ORION – The Chief Mate holds a master unlimited license. He has been a mariner since 1987, and been aboard the vessel since November 24, 2002. The lookout holds an able-bodied seaman document. He has been a mariner since 1992, and been aboard the vessel since January 15, 2003.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

3. Electronic Aids and Charts

· VILLE D' ORION – The chart in use during the collision was BA (British Admiralty) 4809. Hourly plots were observed on the chart as well as a 090 degrees track line. Position plots were made using a GPS model NT200GPS, STN Atlas BSH/029/08266/2/96. The Chief Mate maintained his watch from a chair, looking forward and into the vessels ARPA radar (See Exhibit 5). The secondary radar system was located just left of the ARPA radar and was of the same make and model as the master. The ARPA radar was model Bediengeraet BD 3006, WNr. 00289 G005. The Chief Mate stated that he had set the alarm ranges of TCPA at 15 minutes, and the CPA at 1 mile. However, during periods of heavy weather he had secured the alarm due to the amount of sea and weather clutter appearing on the radar (See Exhibit 4). The lookout was physically located on the bridge looking forward (See Exhibit 5).

· TOP GLORY - no data available.

4. Publications


· TOP GLORY - no data available.

5. Standing Orders

· VILLE D' ORION – The most recent entry into the captain's standing order book was dated January 16, 2003 which stated “observe instruction of former master closely”.

· TOP GLORY – no data available.

CHRONOLOGY / TIMELINE:

1. On January 23, 2003, at 0400 the M/V VILLE D' ORION was on a course of 090 degrees true with a speed of 20 knots (See Exhibit 9). M/V TOP GLORY was underway on an unknown course and speed.
2. 0400: The VILLE D'ORION had the following on watch and on the bridge; Deck Officer–Chief Mate [REDACTED], Lookout–A/B [REDACTED] (See Exhibits 4 & 8).

3. 0445: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate had “felt a pitch on the portside.” The Chief Mate stated that he immediately went out on the port side bridge wing, but did not observe another vessel (See Exhibit 4).

4. 0445-0452: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate stated that he had made 3-4 attempts on VHF radio channel 16, indicated his vessel's name location and asking “Is there anyone that hit me or collided?” No answer was received (See Exhibit 4).

5. 0452: The VILLE D'ORION Chief Mate called and notified the Captain that the vessel may have hit something (See Exhibits 4 & 8). He remarked the radar was full of clutter.

6. 0454 The VILLE D'ORION Captain [REDACTED] arrived on the bridge (See Exhibit 2).

7. 0504: The VILLE D'ORION Captain acquired the M/V TOP GLORY on the radar and stated that the vessel was 4.5 nautical miles off the starboard aft quarter on a course of 140 degrees and a speed of 9 to 9.4 knots (See Exhibit 2). The Captain also stated that he made radio call attempts over VHF radio to establish communications, but he did not receive a reply. The M/V VILLE D' ORION did not alter or change its course or speed at any time before, during or after the collision (See Exhibit 9).

8. 0530: The VILLE D' ORION Chief Mate conducted a deck inspection of the ship and did not observe any damage (See Exhibit 8).

9. 0700: The M/V VILLE D' ORION ship mechanic [REDACTED] discovered the damage to the vessel's port side (See Exhibits 5 & 8).

10. 1045: The M/V VILLE D' ORION made notification of the collision through DSC distress system (See Exhibit 2).

11. 1233: U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) conducted aircraft overflight and contacted the VILLE D' ORION by way of VHF radio, master confirmed no assistance required and that the vessel was heading to Honolulu (See Exhibits 12 & 15).

12. 1304: USCG conducted aircraft overflight and contacted the TOP GLORY by way of VHF radio; vessel master confirms that his vessel was involved in a collision, but was unable to determine the vessel's name. The master declined any assistance and relayed that he was continuing to his next port of call in Japan (See Exhibits 12 & 15).

13. January 24, 2003, at 0724, the VILLE D' ORION was boarded by a USCG security boarding team (See Exhibit 12).

14. 0740: The VILLE D' ORION was directed to remain at least three nautical miles off shore due to the closure of the anchorages as a result of high winds (See Exhibit 12).

16. 0900: MSO Honolulu Inspection and Investigation personnel boarded the vessel along with the VILLE D'ORION vessel class surveyor (John Mihlbauer, 808-220-7736), owner's representatives (Jonas Lyborg, 251-621-9777 & Dean Robb, 808-523-2703), and vessel agent (Russell Moore, 808-544-0453). The TOP GLORY surveyor (John Riley, 310-394-3190) also accompanied (See Exhibit 16).

17. 1600: MSO Honolulu personnel departed the vessel.

18. January 26, 2003, at 0800 VILLE D' ORION entered Honolulu Harbor and moored alongside Pier 1 to make temporary repairs to the fractures in the port side shell.


CONCLUSIONS:

Since little information or corroborating evidence could be obtained from the M/V TOP GLORY (aside from initial USCG aerial damage estimates), a complete analysis of the incident could not be performed to determine the manner of situation between the involved vessels (i.e., overtaking, crossing, or meeting) as well as operations aboard the TOP GLORY.

LIST OF EXHIBITS:

Exhibit 1  IMO Marine Casualty and Incident Report
Exhibit 2  Written statement from the master of the M/V VILLE D' ORION
Exhibit 3  Conversation record between USCG and lookout
Exhibit 4  Conversation record between USCG and chief mate
Exhibit 5  Digital Pictures (taken by USCG MSO Honolulu)
Exhibit 6  M/V VILLE D' ORION watch keeping schedule
Exhibit 7  M/V VILLE D' ORION particulars
Exhibit 8  M/V VILLE D' ORION copy of logbook entries for January 23, 2003
Exhibit 9  M/V VILLE D' ORION copy of deck log entries for January 23, 2003
Exhibit 10  M/V VILLE D' ORION crew list
Exhibit 11  E-mail message from M/V TOP GLORY to vessel agent
Exhibit 12  USCG Situation Report (SITREP)
Exhibit 13  M/V TOP GLORY vessel profile
Exhibit 14  M/V VILLE D' ORION vessel profile
Exhibit 15  VHS videotape of USCG overflight and damage survey
Exhibit 16  List of other involved parties

Incident Involved: Marine Casualty, Reportable

Level of Investigation: Data Collection
IMO Classification: Serious Incident
USCG Classification: Routine
Was this a Serious Marine Incident? No
Report of Investigation

Was a Marine Board Convened by Commandant? No

**Personnel Casualty Summary**

- Total Missing (Active Search) = 0
- Total Missing (Presumed Lost) = 0
- Total Dead = 0
- Total Injured = 0
- Total Uninjured = 0
- Total People at Risk = 21
- Other Personnel (Not at Risk) = 0

**Vessel(s) Status Summary**

- Actual Total Loss(es) = 0
- Total Constructive Loss, Salvaged = 0
- Total Constructive Loss, Unsalvaged = 0
- Damaged = 2
- Undamaged = 0

**Property Damage Summary/Total Damage**

- Vessel(s) = $1500000*
- Cargo = $
- Facility(s) = $
- Other = $

* Includes estimates

**Waterway Mobility Summary**

- Vessel Delays (including speed restrictions): None
III. ACTIONS IN RESPONSE TO THIS REPORT

Actions on Recommendations

Safety Alerts
IV. FINDINGS OF FACT

Subjects of the Investigation

Vessels. The following vessels were subjects of this investigation. Particulars for each vessel follow.

Vessel Name: TOP GLORY
Flag: LIBERIA
Vessel Identification Number: CG002352
Call Sign: ELPK5
Status: Damaged
Role: Involved in a Marine Casualty
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type: Bulk Carrier, General, General
Gross Tonnage(GRT):
Net Tonnage(NRT): 41061
Deadweight Tons: 572.5
Length:
Home/Hailing Port:
Keel Laid Date: 06/22/1984
Delivery Date: 12/07/1984
Place of Construction: JAPAN, ,
Builder Name:
Propulsion: Diesel Direct
Horsepower: 8492
Master:
Classification Society: AMERICAN BUREAU OF SHIPPING
Owner: TOP GLORY SHIPPING CO. LTD.
27/F TOP GLORY TOWER
262 GLOUCESTER ROAD
CAUSEWAY BAY, ,
HK
Operator: MANHATTAN SHIPPING CANADA LTD.
805-475 HOWE ST
VANCOUVER, , V6C2B3
BRITISH COLUMBIA, CA

Inspection Subchapter:
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity:

Vessel Name: VILLE D'ORION
Flag: GERMANY
Vessel Identification Number: 9125619
Call Sign: DABL
Status: Damaged
Report of Investigation

Role: Involved in a Marine Casualty
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type: General Dry Cargo Ship, Container Ship, General

Gross Tonnage(GRT):
Net Tonnage(NRT):
Deadweight Tons: 49212
Length: 259.4
Home/Hailing Port:
Keel Laid Date:
Delivery Date: 01/24/1997
Place of Construction:
Builder Name:
Propulsion: Diesel Direct
Horsepower: 39670
Master:
Classification Society: GERMANISCHER LLOYD
Owner: CONTI CARTEGENA SCHIFFAHRTS.GMBH
C/O N.S.B
HURBURGER STRABE 4,21 614
BUXTEHUDE, ,
GM
Operator: N.S.B.
HARGURGER STRABE 4
D 21 614
BUXTEHUDE, ,
GM

Inspection Subchapter:
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity:

Facilities. The following facilities were subjects of this investigation. Particulars for each facility follow.

Parties and Organizations. The following people and organizations were subjects of this investigation.

Response Resources. The following incident response resources were subjects of this investigation.

Other Subjects. The following were subjects of this investigation.

Waterway Segment(s). The following waterway segment(s) were subjects of this investigation.

North Pacific Ocean
Role: Location
Local Name:
Report of Investigation

Description: 275 nm NNW of Kauai

---

**Incident Information**

**Location(s).**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Latitude</th>
<th>Longitude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North Pacific Ocean</td>
<td>26 52.1 N</td>
<td>160 46.4 W</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Pacific Ocean</td>
<td>26 52.1 N</td>
<td>160 46.4 W</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sequence of Events.**

01/23/2003 4:00 to 01/23/2003 5:00 (Estimated): Chief Mate stated the following weather conditions: visibility - 0 - 5 miles, seas - 7 meters, wind SSW Beaufort force 7-8 (28-40 knots), skies - passing heavy rain

Condition Class: Marine Environment
Condition Type: Marine Environment
Subject Type:
Location: Known; International Waters
Description: North Pacific Ocean
Latitude: 26 52.1 N Longitude: 160 46.4 W

**Subject(s) and Details:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North Pacific Ocean</td>
<td>Waterway</td>
<td></td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Details Filed: Marine Environment Details

**Weather Conditions:**

Weather Forecast

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th>Actual Weather</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wind Speed:</td>
<td>35 Knots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wind Direction:</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wind Gusts:</td>
<td>40 Knots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ceiling:</td>
<td>Feet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sky Conditions:</td>
<td>Sky obscured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Temperature:</td>
<td>° F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weather/Precipitation:</td>
<td>Rain showers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visibility/Precipitation:</td>
<td>Blowing spray</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visibility:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Precipitation (24 hr period):</td>
<td>0 nm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea Level Pressure:</td>
<td>Millibars</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Weather a Forecast Obtained:
Date/Time Obtained:
Source of Forecast:
How were Conditions Predicted:
Weather Forecast Error: No

**Water Conditions:**

Water Forecast

Actual Water Conditions

16
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOP GLORY</td>
<td>Vessel</td>
<td>Damaged</td>
<td>Involved in a Marine Casualty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Details Filed: Detail Description**

Vessel course and speed unknown. Subject vessel did not enter a U.S. port following the collision. No interviews or relevant data was collected.

**Details Filed: Collision Details**

- Location of Impact: Starboard Bow
- Above/Below WaterLine: Below
- Vessel Course: 140 True
- Vessel Speed: 9 Knots
- Steering Functional: Fully
- Propulsion Functional: Fully
- Fuel On Board: Bunker

**Cargo**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cargo Name</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VILLE D'ORION</td>
<td>Vessel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Additional Information:** Vessel was reportedly carrying gypsum.
Vessel was on a course of 090 degrees true proceeding at 20 knots. There were two watch standers on the bridge. Able bodied seaman [OBSCURED] was the lookout and the chief mate [OBSCURED] was the officer on the bridge. They both indicated through an interview that the visibility was less than a mile and at times they could not see their own vessels bow mast. The chief mate was monitoring the radar equipped with ARPA. He stated that the weather and seas created too much clutter to use the collision alarm. Neither watch stander observed the M/V TOP GLORY prior to the collision.

Details Filed: Collision Details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location of Impact:</th>
<th>Port Midships</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Above/Below WaterLine:</td>
<td>Below</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vessel Course:</td>
<td>90 True</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vessel Speed:</td>
<td>20.4 Knots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steering Functional:</td>
<td>Fully</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Propulsion Functional:</td>
<td>Fully</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel On Board:</td>
<td>Bunker 125 Metric Tons (Liquid)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cargo On Board:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cargo Name</strong></td>
<td><strong>Quantity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional Information:</td>
<td>Vessel was carrying solely containerized freight.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
V. CAUSAL ANALYSIS

The Initiating Event of the Incident

Initiating Event:

Collision (01/23/2003 4:40:00 AM)

Production Factors

Preconditions

Workplace Factors

Organization Factors

Defense Factors

Defenses that were in place but were disabled - Engineered defenses deactivated to meet conflicting goals

M/V VILLE D’ ORION was in an area of restricted visibility, and did not have the vessel's sound signal energized.
Collision: 01/23/2003 4:40:00 AM, North Pacific Ocean, VILLE D'ORION

Defenses that could reasonably have been expected but were removed - Removed engineered defenses

Chief Mate disabled the collision alarm on the ARPA due to false alarming caused by the heavy weather.
Collision: 01/23/2003 4:40:00 AM, North Pacific Ocean, VILLE D'ORION

Failures of Defense Against Subsequent Events in the Incident
VI. REFERRAL FOR ENFORCEMENT ACTION

The following referrals for enforcement action have been made as a result of this investigation and represent those instances where the Coast Guard has gathered evidence that indicates one or more alleged violations or offenses may have occurred. Any determinations as to whether or not one or more actual violations or offenses have occurred are documented in the appropriate Coast Guard enforcement activities.
APPENDIX 1 - EVIDENCE

ECN1740464 #1 JBS: Document/Other Document
IMO Report on Marine Casualty and Incident
Collection Information:
   Date/Time:  01/25/2003 1:41:00 PM
   Location:  Honolulu, HI
   Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
   Witnessed By:  USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #10 JBS: Document/Other Document
M/V VILLE D' ORION copy of crew list
Collection Information:
   Date/Time:  01/25/2003 2:54:00 PM
   Location:  Honolulu, HI
   Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
   Witnessed By:  USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #11 JBS: Document/Other Document
Copy of e-mail notification of collision from the M/V TOP GLORY
Collection Information:
   Date/Time:  01/23/2003 2:55:00 PM
   Location:  Honolulu, HI
   Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
   Witnessed By:  USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #12 JBS: Document/Other Document
CG Situation Report
Collection Information:
   Date/Time:  01/25/2003 2:57:00 PM
   Location:  Honolulu, HI
   Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
   Witnessed By:  USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #13 JBS: Document/Other Document
M/V TOP GLORY Vessel Critical Profile
Collection Information:
   Date/Time:  02/03/2003 2:58:00 PM
   Location:  Honolulu, HI
Report of Investigation

Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #14 JBS: Document/Other Document
M/V VILLE D' ORION Vessel Critical Profile
Collection Information:
Date/Time:  02/03/2003 3:00:00 PM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #15 JBS: Physical/Video Tape
VHS tape of CG overflight and damage survey of M/V VILLE D' ORION
Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/27/2003 3:03:00 PM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #16 JBS: Document/Other Document
Copy of vessel agents
Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/25/2003 3:04:00 PM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #2 JBS: Document/Written Statement
Statement from master of VILLE D' ORION
Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/25/2003 10:00:00 AM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #3 JBS: Document/Summary of Conversation
Lookout ______________________
Collection Information:
Report of Investigation

Date/Time:  01/25/2003 11:00:00 AM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Attachments:

ECN1740464 #4 JBS: Document/Summary of Conversation

Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/25/2003 12:50:00 PM
Location:  Honolulu
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Attachments:

ECN1740464 #5 JBS: Electronic/Digital Photographs

Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/25/2003 9:00:00 AM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigation, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Attachments:
- bridge1.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- bridge2.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- damagedeckview1.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- damagedeckview2.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- Port1.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- Port2.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- Port3.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- Portbow.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- Portwide.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;
- radarcontrol.jpg; MSO HONOLULU; Stellflug, James B.; 02/06/2003;

ECN1740464 #6 JBS: Document/Other Document

Watch schedule for VILLE D' ORION

Collection Information:
Date/Time:  01/25/2003 2:09:00 PM
Location:  Honolulu, HI
Collected By:  USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
Witnessed By:  USCG Witness;

Attachments:

ECN1740464 #7 JBS: Document/Other Document
Report of Investigation

VILLE D' ORION particulars

Collection Information:
- Date/Time: 01/25/2003 2:17:00 PM
- Location: Honolulu, HI
- Collected By: USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
- Witnessed By: USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #8 JBS: Document/Logbook
Copy of VILLE D' ORION log book entry for 23Jan03

Collection Information:
- Date/Time: 01/25/2003 2:19:00 PM
- Location: Honolulu, HI
- Collected By: USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
- Witnessed By: USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments:

ECN1740464 #9 JBS: Document/Logbook
Copy of VILLE D' ORION deck log

Collection Information:
- Date/Time: 01/25/2003 2:20:00 PM
- Location: Honolulu, HI
- Collected By: USCG Gathered; Investigations, HONMS
- Witnessed By: USCG Witness;

Tracking:
Attachments: